



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

## CRITICAL NOTES.

### THE SO-CALLED AGRAPHA.

TO KNOW a little more of the life of Christ, whether of his works or words, than the tradition embodied in the gospels tells has from early times been the eager desire of men. Apocryphal books almost without number have one after another held the attention of great numbers of Christians, only to be recognized in the end as disappointing fictions. One line of serious investigation, however, has been followed persistently and hopefully—the search for scattered sayings of the Lord preserved outside of the canonical gospels, the so-called Agrapha. One of these is familiar to all, the word quoted in Paul's speech at Miletus, Acts 20 : 35, and was early noticed. That the writings of the Fathers contain others which may have claims to genuineness was also seen centuries ago, and the great patristic editors of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries collected in their notes much valuable material bearing on the subject. Collections of the sayings themselves were also made, and under various names (among which that of "Agrapha" seems first to occur in 1776) have been current ever since Grabe published in 1698 in his *Spicilegium* eleven *Dicta Jesu Christi quæ in IV. Evangeliiis non extant*. Of recent collections of the more important Agrapha, R. Hofmann's, in his *Leben Jesu nach den Apokryphen*, Westcott's, in his *Introduction to the Study of the Gospels*, and Schaff's, in the first volume of his *History of the Christian Church*, are easily accessible and convenient examples. These and similar collections have generally contained from twenty to thirty sayings, and have been largely dependent on the lists of Grabe and Fabricius.

It has long been clear that such collections as these and such special investigations of Agrapha as are to be found in Hilgenfeld's *Novum Testamentum extra canonem receptum*, Nicholson's *The Gospel according to the Hebrews*, and Zahn's *Geschichte des neutestamentlichen Kanons* had only prepared the way for an exhaustive collection and investigation of the material relating to the subject. This was undertaken by Dr. Alfred Resch, in his *Agrapha : Aussercanonische Evangelienfragmente in möglichster Vollständigkeit zusammengestellt und quellenkritisch*

*untersucht*, published in 1889 in volume V of von Gebhardt and Harnack's *Texte und Untersuchungen*. Resch has carried on this and similar researches in the interest of his theory of the origin of the synoptic gospels. He holds to an original Hebrew (not Aramaic) gospel, consisting chiefly of a report of sayings of Jesus, written by the apostle Matthew, which all three synoptic evangelists largely used, each making his own translation, and which was also used by Paul and the other New Testament writers. Through this solution of the synoptic problem he has been led on to the view that the differences from the ordinary text of the gospels exhibited by patristic references to the life and sayings of our Lord are to be explained by the same original Hebrew gospel, which, though never mentioned, yet persisted into late times, and was consulted and valued by ecclesiastical writers down to the fifth century, if not later.

This theory naturally sharpened Resch's eye greatly for what would be after all the only convincing proof that he could offer for his theory, namely, passages quoted by the New Testament writers or the Fathers, but not found in the canonical gospels and naturally to be ascribed to this Hebrew gospel. The peculiarities of patristic quotations of well-known sayings can be accounted for, as he himself saw, by the assumption of variations in the text of our gospels or of inexact quotation, but the existence of a considerable number of sayings of Jesus not drawn from the gospels might be a strong argument for the source which Resch believes in. This argument would be strengthened if it could be made plausible that various passages in the New Testament epistles also are really dependent on sayings of Jesus which have been preserved outside of the canonical gospels.

With this purpose Resch made a collection of Agrapha which entirely supersedes in completeness all previous lists. He has used diligently and exhaustively the work of his predecessors and made wide researches on his own account. All the cases that could be found in which the saying in question had been quoted by any ancient writer have been put together, with full text and references, and in each case a parallel has been supplied from the New Testament, intended to show that either Luke or the writer of one of the epistles was acquainted with the saying in its Hebrew form. Elaborate critical discussions are appended, and it is everywhere pointed out with great ingenuity how the theory of a Hebrew original explains the divergent forms in which the saying appears. In all seventy-five Agrapha are collected, which Resch believes probably to have come from this

Hebrew primitive gospel, and to be the genuine words of the Lord. As an appendix he gives a large collection of "Apokrypha," being sayings ascribed to Jesus or notices of his life which he holds not to have historical value, together with a number of sayings ascribed to the apostles. Among these "Apokrypha" figure prominently the quotations of Clement, Origen, Eusebius and Jerome from the gospel according to the Hebrews, which Resch believes to have been a work of no independent significance. Apart from the gospel according to the Hebrews and the gospel according to the Egyptians, Resch very properly neglects in his investigation the apocryphal gospels.

In completeness Resch left little to be desired. Two passages from the Talmud can be added to his collection. Seven sayings from the gnostic book *Pistis Sophia* perhaps deserve to be included in the list of "Apokrypha," twelve passages from the New Testament or from New Testament MSS. ought to be counted in, and a few other single Agrapha have been pointed out, but it is unlikely that later gleaners in the field will find much to add. What is needed is rigorous criticism of the material now in hand, for in this respect Resch's work has been generally found highly unsatisfactory. The defects of his method are several. He has failed to take into account the great number of possible explanations in cases where he tries the perilous method of explaining variation by a retranslation of both forms of the saying into Hebrew, and his use of Hebrew itself in such cases has been declared by a competent critic<sup>1</sup> to be marked by insufficient scholarship. In this matter, and in his argument in general, what he has to say often becomes plausible only if one has already accepted the theory of a primitive Hebrew gospel, called (what is almost inconceivable) ἡ γραφή by Paul, and used abundantly but left punctiliously unmentioned by the Fathers. But this theory rests largely on Resch's results in this very investigation of the Agrapha; and it is itself from the start so obviously loaded down with improbabilities that to assume it as the basis of the investigation is a glaring *petitio principii*. In many cases the saying in question is not stated by the patristic writer to be from the Lord, and owes its admission to the list of Agrapha solely to the fact that not having been traced elsewhere it commends itself to Resch as appropriate to his assumed Hebrew gospel. But a perhaps even more important defect of method is the total absence of criticism in respect to the relations of the sources. Apart from some mere blunders, in

<sup>1</sup> A. Rahlfs in W. Bousset's review of Resch, *Theologische Literaturzeitung*, 1893, col. 377 f.

which a passage from a patristic writer is found quoted, in a catena for instance, and made to do duty over again, Resch has generally neglected to ask whether the writers on whose testimony reliance is placed had ever read the works of their predecessors. Thus a more or less closely related series of Fathers, running from Clement of Alexandria through Origen, Dionysius of Alexandria, Pamphilus, Basil, Cyril of Jerusalem, Chrysostom, Jerome, Cyril of Alexandria, may be presented as if they offered independent witness to the existence of a Hebrew gospel from which each had separately derived the Agraphton in question. Resch's witnesses are often reduced from a large number to one or two, when the question of their probable dependence on one another is fairly examined. Resch's thesaurus, then, simply provides the means, if supplemented by some few additions that can be made, for drawing up a list of those Agraphta which can present some claim to be deemed genuine sayings of the Lord.

## I.

1. From all the material that has been gathered, that part must first be excluded in which the writer who quotes the alleged Agraphton has not affirmed it to be a saying of Christ. These constitute in themselves a little more than half of the Logia held by Resch to be probably genuine.

a) In some cases close examination shows that the writer was not giving a quotation at all, but was merely paraphrasing, in homiletical fashion, the thought of Jesus. One of the best examples here is furnished by Resch's Logion 6.

Hippolytus (?), *Demonstratio adv. Judaeos*, VII:

ὁθεν λέγει: γενηθήτω, ὁ πατήρ, ὁ ναὸς αὐτῶν ἡρημωμένος.

Whence he says: "Let their temple, Father, be desolate."

This occurs in the course of an exposition of Psalm 69:19-28, and although the subject of λέγει is undoubtedly Christ, the context shows that the apparent quotation is meant merely as an explanatory paraphrase of verse 25 of the psalm.

b) In addition to these a large number of cases are found in which ecclesiastical writers make quotations, as if from the Scriptures, the source of which has not been found. Some of these untraced quotations are in the New Testament itself (for instance, Eph. 5:14; James 4:5). These have, whenever possible, been seized upon by Resch as fragments of his lost Hebrew gospel. It is plain

that they can be regarded as such only after the existence of such a gospel has been proved. In most, if not all, cases there is no reason whatever to suppose that the words of the Lord are here quoted. One example of the many which might be adduced is the following :<sup>2</sup>

Clemens Alex., *Strom.*, I, 8, 41 :

οὗτοι οἱ τὰ κατάρτια κατασπῶντες καὶ μηθὲν ὑφαίνοντες, φησὶν ἡ γραφή.

"These are they who ply their looms and weave nothing," saith the Scripture.

The fact that the source of this is unknown, and that it is not inconceivable in the mouth of Jesus, is surely no sufficient reason for ascribing it to him.

2. Among the sayings also which are actually quoted by ancient writers as from the Lord, a few can be at once excluded, because they are plainly merely parallel, or at most expanded and inferior, forms of genuine sayings found in our gospels. These may often have stood in their uncanonical form in some apocryphal gospel.

For instance :<sup>3</sup>

*Clem. Hom.*, XII, 29 :

ὁ τῆς ἀληθείας προφήτης ἔφη· τὰ ἀγαθὰ ἐλθεῖν δεῖ, μακάριος δέ, φησί, δι' οὗ ἔρχεται· ὁμοίως· καὶ τὰ κακὰ ἀνάγκη ἐλθεῖν, οὐαὶ δὲ δι' οὗ ἔρχεται.

The prophet of truth said : "Good things must come, but blessed," saith he, "is he through whom they come;" in like manner "it must needs be also that evils come, but woe to him through whom they come."

The pointlessness of the uncanonical addition, which is found also in Aphraates, betrays it here as secondary to the canonical saying, Matt. 18 : 7, Luke 17 : 1.

3. Another small group consists of cases in which a saying from some other source, usually from some part of the Bible, is wrongly ascribed to the Lord. That in all early Christian literature eleven such mistakes should be known is not surprising. The following example, not given by Resch, illustrates sufficiently the group :

Proverbs 15 : 1 :

ὀργὴ ἀπόλλυσιν καὶ φρονίμους.

*Didascalia Apostolorum syriaca* (p. 11, l. 12) :

ὅτι λέγει κύριος· ὀργὴ καὶ φρονίμους ἀπόλλυσιν.

For the Lord saith : "Wrath destroyeth even wise men."

<sup>2</sup> Resch, Logion 38.

<sup>3</sup> Resch, Logion 13.

The *Apostolic Constitutions* has in the corresponding place (II, 3) σοφία instead of κύριος. Perhaps the error is due to the Syriac translator or scribe.

## II.

When these various classes of Agrapha wrongly so-called have been excluded, there remains a large number of sayings, including most of those commonly gathered into the incomplete lists, which purport to be words of the Lord and of which the probable genuineness must be considered in each case by itself. In every one the final judgment will rest on the answer to two questions: *first*, is it reasonable to suppose that trustworthy tradition on this matter should have reached the writer who makes the saying known to us? and, *secondly*, is the saying conceivable in the mouth of Jesus as known to us in the gospels? In the answer to both these questions a considerable subjective element must necessarily enter, and in individual cases there will doubtless always remain differences of judgment. The matter is complicated by the possibility often present that a saying in its transmitted form clearly apocryphal may yet have a kernel of genuineness. I believe, however, that in all but a few cases the evidence is clear, in most of these plainly to the disadvantage of the Agraphon.

## A

It may be well first to collect here a few of the more interesting Agrapha which seem plainly not to be genuine words of the Lord.

Clem. Alex., *Strom.*, V, 10, 64: <sup>4</sup>

λέγει γὰρ ὁ προφήτης· παραβολὴν κυρίου τίς νοήσει εἰ μὴ σοφὸς καὶ ἐπιστήμων καὶ ἀγαπῶν τὸν κύριον αὐτοῦ; ἐπὶ ὀλίγων ἐστὶ ταῦτα χωρῆσαι. οὐ γὰρ φθονῶν, φησί, παρήγγειλεν ὁ κύριος ἔν τινι εὐαγγελίῳ· μυστήριον ἑμὸν ἐμοὶ καὶ τοῖς υἱοῖς τοῦ οἴκου μου.

For the prophet saith: Who shall know the parable of the Lord except the wise and understanding and that loveth his Lord? It belongeth to a few only to receive these things. For not grudgingly, he saith, did the Lord declare in a certain gospel: "My mystery is for me and for the sons of my house."

This saying seems to have been taken up by some apocryphal gospel from Isaiah 24:16, where it is found in the translations of Theodotion and Symmachus.

<sup>4</sup> Resch, Logion 17.

Origen, *In Joann.*, Tom. II, 6 :<sup>5</sup>

ἐὰν δὲ προσίεται τις τὸ καθ' Ἑβραίους εὐαγγέλιον, ἔνθα αὐτὸς ὁ σωτὴρ φησιν.  
ἄρτι ἔλαβέ με ἡ μήτηρ μου τὸ ἅγιον πνεῦμα ἐν μιᾷ τῶν τριχῶν μου καὶ ἀπήνεγκέ  
με εἰς τὸ ὄρος τὸ μέγα Θαβώρ.

And if anyone goes to the gospel according to the Hebrews, there the Saviour himself saith : "Just now my mother the Holy Spirit took me by one of my hairs and carried me off to the great mountain Tabor."

Jerome, *De viris illustribus*, II :<sup>6</sup>

Evangelium quoque quod appellatur secundum Hebræos et a me nuper in Græcum Latinumque sermonem translatum est, quo et Origenes sæpe utitur, post resurrectionem Salvatoris refert : Dominus autem cum dedisset sindonem servo sacerdotis ivit ad Jacobum et apparuit ei. Iuraverat enim Jacobus se non comesturum panem ab illa hora qua biberat calicem Domini (*v. l.* Dominus), donec videret eum resurgentem a dormientibus.

Rursusque post paululum : Afferte, ait Dominus, mensam et panem. Statimque additur : Tulit panem et benedixit ac fregit et dedit Jacobo Justo et dixit ei : Frater mi, comede panem tuum, quia resurrexit filius hominis a dormientibus.

Also the so-called gospel according to the Hebrews, which was recently translated by me into Greek and Latin, which Origen, too, often uses, relates after the resurrection of the Saviour : But when the Lord had given the linen cloth to the priest's servant, he went to James and appeared to him. For James had taken an oath that he would not eat bread from that hour in which he had drunk the cup of the Lord (*or*, in which the Lord had drunk the cup) until he should see him rising from them that sleep.

And again, a little farther on : "Bring me," saith the Lord, "a table and bread." And there follows immediately : He took the bread and blessed and brake and gave to James the Just, and said to him : "My brother, eat thy bread, inasmuch as the Son of Man hath risen from them that sleep."

Irenæus, V, 33, 3 f. :<sup>7</sup>

Quemadmodum presbyteri meminerunt, qui Joannem discipulum Domini viderunt, audisse se ab eo, quemadmodum de temporibus illis

<sup>5</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 14.

<sup>7</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 95.

<sup>6</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 50.



docebat Dominus et dicebat: Venient dies in quibus vineæ nascentur singulæ decem millia palmitum habentes, et in uno palmite dena millia brachiorum, et in uno vero palmite [i. brachio] dena millia flagellorum, et in unoquoque flagello dena millia botruum, et in unoquoque botro dena millia acinorum, et unumquodque acinum expressum dabit vigintiquinque metretas vini. Et cum eorum apprehenderit aliquis sanctorum botrum, alius clamabit: Botrus ego melior sum, me sume, per me Dominum benedic. Similiter et granum tritici decem millia spicarum generaturum, et unamquamque spicam habituram decem millia granorum, et unumquodque granum quinque bilibres similæ claræ mundæ: et reliqua autem poma et semina et herbam secundum congruentiam iis consequentem: et omnia animalia iis cibus utentia, quæ a terra accipiuntur, pacifica et consentanea invicem fieri, subiecta hominibus cum omni subiectione.

Hæc autem et Papias, Joannis auditor, Polycarpi autem contubernalis, vetus homo, per scripturam testimonium perhibet in quarto librorum suorum: sunt enim illi quinque libri conscripti. Et adiecit dicens: Hæc autem credibilia sunt credentibus. Et Juda, inquit, proditor non credente et interrogante: Quomodo ergo tales genituræ a Domino perficientur? dixisse Dominum: Videbunt qui venient in illa.

As the elders, who saw John the disciple of the Lord, relate, that they had heard from him, how the Lord used to teach concerning those times, and to say: "The days will come, in which vines shall grow, each having ten thousand shoots, and on each shoot ten thousand branches, and on each branch again ten thousand twigs, and on each twig ten thousand clusters, and on each cluster ten thousand grapes, and each grape when pressed shall yield five-and-twenty measures of wine. And when any of the saints shall have taken hold of one of their clusters, another shall cry: I am a better cluster; take me, bless the Lord through me. Likewise also a grain of wheat shall produce ten thousand heads, and every head shall have ten thousand grains, and every grain ten pounds of fine flour, bright and clean, and the other fruits, seeds, and the grass shall produce in similar proportions, and all the animals, using these fruits which are products of the soil, shall become in their turn peaceable and harmonious, obedient to man in all subjection."

These things Papias, who was a hearer of John and a companion of Polycarp, an ancient worthy, witnesseth in writing in the fourth of his books, for there are five books composed by him. And he added, saying: "But these things are credible to them that believe." And when Judas the traitor did not believe, and asked, How shall such growths be accomplished by the Lord? he relates that the Lord said: "They shall see, who shall come to these [times]."

Hippolytus, *Comm. in Daniele*, lib. IV (ed. Bratke, p. 44):

τοῦ οὖν κυρίου διηγουμένου τοῖς μαθηταῖς περὶ τῆς μελλούσης τῶν ἁγίων βασιλείας ὡς εἶη ἔνδοξος καὶ θαυμαστή, καταπλαγεὶς ὁ Ἰούδας ἐπὶ τοῖς λεγομένοις ἔφη· καὶ τίς ἄρα ὄψεται ταῦτα; ὁ δὲ κύριος ἔφη· ταῦτα ὄψονται οἱ ἄξιοι γινόμενοι.

So when the Lord told the disciples about the coming kingdom of the saints, how it was glorious and marvelous, Judas, amazed at what was said, said: And who then shall see these things? And the Lord replied: "These things shall they see who become worthy."

Matt. 6:13 (Textus Receptus):

ὅτι σοῦ ἐστιν ἡ βασιλεία καὶ ἡ δύναμις καὶ ἡ δόξα εἰς τοὺς αἰῶνας. ἀμήν.

"For thine is the kingdom and the power and the glory. Amen."

*Codex Algerinae Peckover*, 713<sup>ev</sup>, Matt. 17:26 f.:

ἔφη αὐτῷ ὁ Ἰησοῦς· ἄραγε ἐλεύθεροί εἰσιν οἱ υἱοί. ἔφη Σίμων· ναί. λέγει ὁ Ἰησοῦς· δὸς οὖν καὶ σύ, ὡς ἀλλότριος αὐτῶν.

Jesus said unto him: Therefore the sons are free. Simon said: Yea. Jesus saith: "Give thou therefore also, as if a stranger to them."

Mark 9:49 (Textus Receptus):

καὶ πάντα θυσία ἀλὶ ἀλισθήσεται.

"And every sacrifice shall be salted with salt."

This seems to be derived from Lev. 2:13.

Mark 16:15-18:

καὶ εἶπεν αὐτοῖς· πορευθέντες εἰς τὸν κόσμον ἅπαντα, κηρύξατε τὸ εὐαγγέλιον πάσῃ τῇ κτίσει. ὁ πιστεύσας καὶ βαπτισθεὶς σωθήσεται, ὁ δὲ ἀπιστήσας κατακριθήσεται. σημεῖα δὲ τοῖς πιστεύουσιν ἀκολουθήσει ταῦτα, ἐν τῷ ὀνόματί μου δαιμόνια ἐκβαλοῦσιν, γλώσσαις λαλήσουσιν, καὶ ἐν ταῖς χερσὶν ὄφεις ἀροῦσιν, κἂν θανάσιμόν τι πῶσιν οὐ μὴ αὐτοὺς βλάψῃ, ἐπὶ ἁρρώστους χεῖρας ἐπιθήσουσιν καὶ καλῶς ἔξουσιν.

And he said unto them: "Go ye into all the world, and preach the

gospel to the whole creation. He that believeth and is baptized shall be saved, but he that disbelieveth shall be condemned. And these signs shall follow them that believe: in my name shall they cast out devils; they shall speak with tongues; and in their hands they shall take up serpents, and if they drink any deadly thing, it shall in no wise hurt them; they shall lay hands on the sick, and they shall recover."

These verses from the unauthentic ending of the gospel of Mark seem to be a general summary of the commission of the apostles resembling the fragments of the *Kerygma Petri* quoted by Clement of Alexandria.

## B

It is of greater interest to look at the Agrapha which seem to have considerable historical value. As to how much value is to be ascribed to each, opinions vary greatly; and the right of all but a very few to a place in the list at all is disputed.<sup>8</sup>

1. Acts 20:35:<sup>9</sup>

μνημονεύειν τε τῶν λόγων τοῦ κυρίου Ἰησοῦ ὅτι αὐτὸς εἶπεν· μακάριόν ἐστιν μᾶλλον διδόναι ἢ λαμβάνειν.

And to remember the words of the Lord Jesus, how he himself said: "It is more blessed to give than to receive."

2. Justin, *Dial.*, 47.<sup>10</sup>

διὸ καὶ ὁ ἡμέτερος κύριος Ἰησοῦς Χριστὸς εἶπεν· ἐν οἷς ἂν ὑμᾶς καταλάβω, ἐν τούτοις καὶ κρινῶ.

Wherefore also our Lord Jesus Christ said: "Where I find you, there will I also judge."

3. Origen, *De orat. libell.*, c. 2.<sup>11</sup>

τὸ μὲν ὃ δεῖ· αἰτέετε τὰ μεγάλα, καὶ τὰ μικρὰ ὑμῖν προστεθήσεται, καί· αἰτέετε τὰ ἐπουράνια, καὶ τὰ ἐπίγεια ὑμῖν προστεθήσεται.

That which is needful: "Ask for the great things and the small shall be added unto you;" and, "Ask for the heavenly things, and the earthly shall be added unto you."

Clement of Alexandria (*Strom.*, I, 24, 158) quotes the first part of

<sup>8</sup>For fuller discussion of these and the other Agrapha, the reader is referred to Resch, *Agrapha*, 1889, and to the present writer's *Die Sprüche Jesu die in den kanonischen Evangelien nicht überliefert sind*, Leipzig, 1896.

<sup>9</sup>Resch, Logion 12.

<sup>10</sup>Resch, Logion 39.

<sup>11</sup>Resch, Logion 41.

this saying, and Eusebius (*In Psalm.* 16:2) introduces the same part with ὁ σωτὴρ ἐδίδασκεν λέγων.

4. Clemens Alex., *Strom.*, I, 28, 177:<sup>12</sup>

εἰκότως ἄρα καὶ ἡ γραφὴ τοιούτους τινὰς ἡμᾶς διαλεκτικούς οὕτως ἐθέλουσα γενέσθαι, παραινεί· γίνεσθε δὲ δόκιμοι τραπεζῖται, τὰ μὲν ἀποδοκιμάζοντες, τὸ δὲ καλὸν κατέχοντες.

Apelles ap. Epiphanius, *Haer.* XLIV, 2 :

οὕτως γάρ, φησίν, ἔφη ἐν τῷ εὐαγγελίῳ· γίνεσθε δόκιμοι τραπεζῖται.

*Didascalía*, II, 36 (Syr., p. 42):

ὅτι εἴρηται αὐτοῖς (i. e. τοῖς ἐπισκόποις)· γίνεσθε τραπεζῖται δόκιμοι.

*Pistis Sophia*, p. 353 (Lat., p. 220):

Respondens σωτηρ dixit Mariæ: dixi vobis olim: estote sicut sapientes τραπεζῖται, scilicet bonum suscipite malum eiicite.

*Clem. Hom.*, II, 51:

εὐλόγως ὁ διδάσκαλος ἡμῶν ἔλεγεν· γίνεσθε τραπεζῖται δόκιμοι.

"Be approved money changers."

For this very often quoted saying, these five witnesses are apparently independent.

5. Rev. 16: 15:<sup>13</sup>

ἰδοὺ ἔρχομαι ὡς κλέπτης· μακάριος ὁ γρηγορῶν καὶ τηρῶν τὰ ἱμάτια αὐτοῦ, ἵνα μὴ γυμνὸς περιπατῇ καὶ βλέπωσιν τὴν ἀσχημοσύνην αὐτοῦ.

"Behold, I come as a thief; blessed is he that watcheth and keepeth his garments, lest he walk naked, and they see his shame."

6. Eusebius, *H. E.*, III, 39, 17:<sup>14</sup>

ἐκτέθειται (sc. ὁ Παπίας) δὲ καὶ ἄλλην ἱστορίαν περὶ γυναίκος ἐπὶ πολλαῖς ἁμαρτίαις διαβληθείσης ἐπὶ τοῦ κυρίου, ἣν τὸ κατ' Ἑβραίους εὐαγγέλιον περιέχει.

And (Papias) has set forth also another story about a woman accused of many sins before the Lord, which the gospel according to the Hebrews contains.

This is undoubtedly the same as John 7: 53—8: 11, the section on the Woman taken in Adultery.

7. Jerome, *In Ezech.* 18: 7:<sup>15</sup>

In evangelio quod iuxta Hebræos Nazaræi legere consueverunt inter maxima ponitur crimina, qui fratris sui spiritum contristaverit.

<sup>12</sup> Resch, Logion 43.

<sup>14</sup> Resch, p. 341.

<sup>13</sup> Resch, Logion 74.

<sup>15</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 7.

In the gospel which the Nazarenes are accustomed to read, that according to the Hebrews, there is put among the greatest crimes, "he who shall have grieved the spirit of his brother."

The judgment as to the value of sayings quoted from the gospel according to the Hebrews will depend on the view taken of the origin and character of that book. If it was a secondary apocryphal gospel, based on the Greek canonical gospels, it will probably have contained little or nothing of independent value. If, on the other hand, it was a gospel embodying the traditions of the evangelical history preserved from the beginning in an isolated body of Palestinian Jewish Christians, it may well have contained, together with grotesque and apocryphal enlargements, some valuable matter peculiar to itself; and the probable genuineness of the sayings must then be determined in each case for itself.

8. Jerome, *In Ephes.* 5:3, 4:<sup>16</sup>

In Hebraico quoque evangelio legimus Dominum ad discipulos loquentem: Et numquam, inquit, læti sitis, nisi quum fratrem vestrum videritis in caritate.

In the Hebrew gospel, too, we read of the Lord saying to the disciples: "And never," said he, "rejoice, except when you have looked upon your brother in love."

9. *II. Clem. Rom.*, V, 2-4:<sup>17</sup>

λέγει γὰρ ὁ κύριος· ἔσεσθε ὡς ἀρνία ἐν μέσῳ λύκων. ἀποκριθεὶς δὲ ὁ Πέτρος αὐτῷ λέγει· ἐὰν οὖν διασπαράξωσιν οἱ λύκοι τὰ ἀρνία; εἶπεν ὁ Ἰησοῦς τῷ Πέτρῳ· μὴ φοβείσθωσαν τὰ ἀρνία τοὺς λύκους μετὰ τὸ ἀποθανεῖν αὐτά· καὶ ὑμεῖς μὴ φοβείσθε τοὺς ἀποκτένοντας ὑμᾶς καὶ μηδὲν ὑμῖν δυναμένους ποιεῖν, ἀλλὰ φοβείσθε τὸν μετὰ τὸ ἀποθανεῖν ὑμᾶς ἔχοντα ἐξουσίαν ψυχῆς καὶ σώματος, τοῦ βαλεῖν εἰς γέενναν πυρός.

For the Lord saith: Ye shall be as lambs in the midst of wolves. But Peter answering saith unto him: What, then, if the wolves should tear the lambs? Jesus said unto Peter: "Let not the lambs fear the wolves after they are dead; and ye also, fear ye not them that kill you and are not able to do anything to you; but fear Him that after ye are dead hath power over soul and body to cast them into the gehenna of fire."

It seems not impossible that this is the original connection of Matt. 10:16 (Luke 10:3) with Matt. 10:28 (Luke 12:4 f.).

<sup>16</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 8.

<sup>17</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 10.

10. Origen, *In Matt.*, Tom. XV, 14, Vetus interpretatio:<sup>18</sup>

Scriptum est in evangelio quodam, quod dicitur secundum Hebræos, si tamen placet alicui suscipere illud non ad auctoritatem sed ad manifestationem propositæ quæstionis: Dixit, inquit, ad eum alter divitum: Magister, quid bonum faciens vivam? Dixit ei: Homo, leges et prophetas fac. Respondit ad eum: Feci. Dixit ei: Vade, vende omnia quæ possides et divide pauperibus et veni, sequere me. Cœpit autem dives scalpere caput suum et non placuit ei. Et dixit ad eum Dominus: Quomodo dicis, legem feci et prophetas, quoniam scriptum est in lege: diliges proximum tuum sicut te ipsum, et ecce multi fratres tui, filii Abrahæ, amicti sunt stercore morientes præ fame, et domus tua plena est multis bonis, et non egreditur omnino aliquid ex ea ad eos. Et conversus dixit Simoni discipulo suo sedenti apud se: Simon, fili Joannæ, facilius est camelum intrare per foramen acus quam divitem in regnum cœlorum.

It is written in a certain gospel, the so-called gospel according to the Hebrews, if anyone likes to take it up not as having any authority but to shed light on the matter in hand: The other, it says, of the rich men said unto him: Master, by doing what good thing shall I have life? He said to him: Man, do the law and the prophets. He answered unto him: I have. He said to him: Go, sell all that thou hast, and divide to the poor, and come, follow me. But the rich man began to scratch his head, and it pleased him not. And the Lord said unto him: "How sayest thou, I have done the law and the prophets, since it is written in the law: Thou shalt love thy neighbor as thyself, and behold, many brethren of thine, sons of Abraham, are clad in filth, dying of hunger, and thy house is full of good things, and nothing at all goes out from it to them." And he turned and said to Simon his disciple who was sitting by him: Simon, son of John, it is easier for a camel to enter through the eye of a needle than for a rich man into the kingdom of heaven.

11. Eusebius, *Theophania Syr.* (ed. S. Lee), IV, 12, pp. 233-4, 235:<sup>19</sup>

The cause therefore of the divisions of the soul that comes to pass in houses he himself taught, as we have found in a place in the gospel existing among the Jews in the Hebrew language, in which is said: "I will select to myself the good, those good ones whom my Father in heaven has given me."

<sup>18</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 17.

<sup>19</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 21 b.

12. Talmud, *Aboda Zara*, 16b, 17a.

The rabbis have the following tradition: When Rabbi Elieser was once imprisoned for heresy (*minuth*, i. e. inclination to the forbidden Christian religion), he was brought before the (Roman) court to be judged. The judge said to him: Does such a mature man as thou art occupy himself with such vain things? Elieser replied: The Judge is just to me. The judge thought that Elieser was speaking of him, in fact he referred to his Father in heaven. Then the judge said: Because I believe thee, thou art acquitted. When Elieser came home, his disciples came to comfort him, but he would accept no comfort. Then R. Akiba said to him: Permit me to say to thee something of that which thou hast taught me. He answered: Say on. Then said R. Akiba: Perhaps thou hast at some time heard a heresy which pleased thee, because of which thou hast now been imprisoned for heresy. Elieser replied: Akiba, thou remindest me. I was once walking in the upper street of Sepphoris; there I met one of the disciples of Jesus of Nazareth, named James of Kephars Sekhanja, who said to me: In your law (Deut. 23: 19) it reads: Thou shalt not bring the hire of an harlot into the house of thy God. Is it lawful that from such gifts one should have a draught house built for the high priest? I knew not what to answer him. Then he said to me: Thus taught me Jesus of Nazareth: "Of the hire of an harlot hath she gathered it, and to the hire of an harlot shall it return (Micah 1: 7); from filth it came, to the place of filth shall it go." This explanation pleased me, and therefore have I been arrested for heresy, because I transgressed the word of Scripture: Remove thy way far from her (Prov. 5: 8), from her, that is, from heresy.

13. Codex Bezae, after Matt. 20: 28.<sup>20</sup>

ὕμεις δὲ ζητεῖτε ἐκ μικροῦ αὐξῆσαι καὶ ἐκ μείζονος ἔλαττον εἶναι. εἰσερχόμενοι δὲ καὶ παρακληθέντες δειπνῆσαι μὴ ἀνακλίνεσθε εἰς τοὺς ἐξέχοντας τόπους, μήποτε ἐνδοξότερός σου ἐπέλθῃ, καὶ προσελθὼν ὁ δειπνοκλήτωρ εἴπῃ σοι· ἔτι κάτω χώρει, καὶ κατασχυνθήσῃ. ἐὰν δὲ ἀναπέσῃς εἰς τὸν ἥττονα τόπον καὶ ἐπέλθῃ σου ἥττων, ἐρεῖ σοι ὁ δειπνοκλήτωρ· σύναγε ἔτι ἄνω, καὶ ἔσται σοι τοῦτο χρήσιμον.

"But ye seek from the small to increase and from the greater to be less. But when ye come in invited to a feast, sit not down in distinguished places, lest one grander than thou arrive, and the giver of the feast come and say to thee, Go farther down, and thou be ashamed.

<sup>20</sup> Resch, pp. 70 ff.

But if thou sit down in the meaner place, and one meaner than thou arrive, the giver of the feast will say to thee, Join [us] farther up, and that shall be to thine advantage."

14. Acts 1:5; 11:16.

Ἰωάννης μὲν ἐβάπτισεν ὕδατι, ὑμεῖς δὲ ἐν πνεύματι βαπτισθήσεσθε ἀγίῳ οὐ μετὰ πολλὰς ταύτας ἡμέρας.

"John indeed baptized with water, but ye shall be baptized with the Holy Ghost not many days hence."

15. 1. Thess. 4:15-17.

τοῦτο γὰρ ὑμῖν λέγομεν ἐν λόγῳ κυρίου, ὅτι ἡμεῖς οἱ ζῶντες οἱ περιλειπόμενοι εἰς τὴν παρουσίαν τοῦ κυρίου οὐ μὴ φθάσωμεν τοὺς κοιμηθέντας· ὅτι αὐτὸς ὁ κύριος ἐν κελεύσματι, ἐν φωνῇ ἀρχαγγέλου καὶ ἐν σάλπιγγι θεοῦ, καταβήσεται ἀπ' οὐρανοῦ, καὶ οἱ νεκροὶ ἐν Χριστῷ ἀναστήσονται πρῶτον, ἔπειτα ἡμεῖς οἱ ζῶντες οἱ περιλειπόμενοι ἅμα σὺν αὐτοῖς ἁρπαγησόμεθα ἐν νεφέλαις εἰς ἀπάντησιν τοῦ κυρίου εἰς ἀέρα· καὶ οὕτως πάντοτε σὺν κυρίῳ ἐσόμεθα.

For this we say unto you in a word of the Lord, that we that are alive, that are left unto the coming of the Lord, shall in no wise precede them that are fallen asleep; for 'the Lord himself shall descend from heaven, with a shout, with the voice of the archangel, and with the trump of God; and the dead in Christ shall rise first; then we that are alive, that are left, shall together with them be caught up in the clouds, to meet the Lord in the air;' and so shall we ever be with the Lord.

### C

In addition to these fifteen Agrapha for which some considerable probability can be claimed, the following deserve to be mentioned. They are sayings which one hesitates to reject altogether, while obstacles exist to their acceptance. They vary greatly in character, and commend themselves in very different degrees.

1. Origen, *Hom. in Jeremiam*, XX, 3.<sup>21</sup>

Legi alicubi quasi Salvatore dicente, et quæro sive quis personam figuravit Salvatoris, sive in memoriam adduxit, an verum sit hoc quod dictum est. Ait autem ipsi (*I. ipse*) Salvator: Qui iuxta me est, iuxta ignem est; qui longe est a me, longe est a regno.

I have read somewhere what purports to be an utterance of the

<sup>21</sup> Resch, Logion 5.



Saviour, and I query (equally if someone put it into the mouth of the Saviour, or if someone remembered it) whether it is true which is said. But the Saviour himself saith: "He who is near me is near the fire, he who is far from me is far from the kingdom."

2. *Excerpta ex Theodoto* ap. Clem. Alex., § 2.<sup>22</sup>

διὰ τοῦτο λέγει ὁ σωτήρ· σώζου σὺ καὶ ἡ ψυχὴ σου.

For this reason the Saviour saith: "Be saved, thou and thy soul."

3. *Apostolic Church-Order*, c. 26 (Hilgenfeld, *N. T. extra canonem*<sup>2</sup>, IV, p. 118).<sup>23</sup>

προέλεγε γὰρ ἡμῖν, ὅτε ἐδίδασκεν, ὅτι τὸ ἀσθενὲς διὰ τοῦ ἰσχυροῦ σωθήσεται.

For he said to us before, when he was teaching, "That which is weak shall be saved through that which is strong."

4. *Didascalia*, II, 8 (Syr., p. 14, l. 15).<sup>24</sup>

λέγει γὰρ ἡ γραφή· ἀνὴρ ἀδόκιμος ἀπείραστος.

For the Scripture saith: "A man is unapproved if he be untempted."

Tertull., *De bapt.*, c. 20.

Vigilate et orate, inquit, ne incidatis in tentationem. Et ideo credo tentati sunt, quoniam obdormierunt, ut apprehensum Dominum destituerint, et qui cum eo perstiterit et gladio sit usus, ter etiam negaverit. Nam et præcesserat dictum: Neminem intentatum regna cœlestia consecuturum.

Watch and pray, he saith, that ye enter not into temptation. And so I think they were tempted, because they fell asleep, so that they failed the Lord after his arrest, and he who continued with him and used the sword even denied him three times. For the saying had also preceded, "that no one untempted should attain to the heavenly realms."

5. Codex Bezae, after Luke 6:4.<sup>25</sup>

τῇ αὐτῇ ἡμέρᾳ θεασάμενός τινα ἐργαζόμενον τῷ σαββάτῳ εἶπεν αὐτῷ· ἄνθρωπε, εἰ μὲν οἶδας τί ποιεῖς, μακάριος εἶ· εἰ δὲ μὴ οἶδας, ἐπικατάρατος καὶ παραβάτης εἶ τοῦ νόμου.

On the same day, seeing one working on the Sabbath, he said to him: "Man, if thou knowest what thou doest, blessed art thou; but if thou knowest not, thou art accursed and a transgressor of the Law."

<sup>22</sup> Resch, Logion 8.

<sup>24</sup> Resch, Logion 26.

<sup>23</sup> Resch, Logion 15.

<sup>25</sup> Resch, Logion 27.

6. Jerome, *Adv. Pelag.*, III, 2.<sup>26</sup>

Ecce mater Domini et fratres eius dicebant ei: Joannes Baptista baptizat in remissionem peccatorum; eamus et baptizemur ab eo. Dixit autem eis: Quid peccavi, ut vadam et baptizer ab eo? nisi forte hoc ipsum, quod dixi, ignorantia est.

Behold, the Lord's mother and his brethren were saying to him: John the Baptist baptizes unto the remission of sins; let us go and be baptized by him. He said unto them: "What sin have I done, that I should go and be baptized by him? unless perchance this very thing which I have said is an ignorance" [*i. e.* a sin].

Jerome says that he has taken this from the gospel according to the Hebrews.

7. Clemens Alex., *Strom.*, V, 14, 96.<sup>27</sup>

ἴσον γὰρ τοῦτοις ἐκέῖνα δύναται· οὐ παύσεται ὁ ζητῶν ἕως ἂν εὕρῃ, εὕρων δὲ θαμβηθήσεται, θαμβηθεὶς δὲ βασιλεύσει, βασιλεύσας δὲ ἐπαναπαύσεται.

For those words have the same meaning with these others: "He that seeketh shall not stop until he find, and when he hath found he shall wonder, and when he hath wondered he shall reign, and when he hath reigned he shall rest."

Clement elsewhere (*Strom.*, II, 9, 45) quotes a part of this saying and says that it comes from the gospel according to the Hebrews.

8. *II. Clem. Rom.*, XII, 2.<sup>28</sup>

ἐπερωτηθεὶς γὰρ αὐτὸς ὁ κύριος ὑπὸ τινος, πότε ἤξει αὐτοῦ ἡ βασιλεία, εἶπεν· ὅταν ἔσται τὰ δύο ἓν, καὶ τὸ ἕξω ὡς τὸ ἔσω, καὶ τὸ ἄρσεν μετὰ τῆς θηλείας, οὔτε ἄρσεν οὔτε θῆλυ.

For the Lord himself, having been asked by someone when his kingdom should come, said: "When the two shall be one, and the outer as the inner, and the male with the female, neither male nor female."

Clemens Alexandrinus.<sup>29</sup>

a) *Strom.*, III, 6, 45:

τῇ Σαλώμῃ ὁ κύριος πυνθανομένη, μέχρι πότε θάνατος ἰσχύσει, οὐχ ὡς κακοῦ τοῦ βίου ὄντος καὶ τῆς κτίσεως πονηρᾶς, μέχρις ἂν, εἶπεν, ὑμεῖς αἱ γυναῖκες τίκτετε.

<sup>26</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 2.

<sup>27</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 11.

<sup>28</sup> Resch, Logion 30.

<sup>29</sup> Resch, Apokryphon 16.

When Salome asked how long death should have power, the Lord (not meaning that life is evil and the creation bad) said: "As long as you women bear."

δ) *Strom.*, III, 9, 63:

οἱ δὲ ἀντιτασσόμενοι τῇ κτίσει τοῦ θεοῦ διὰ τῆς εὐφήμου ἐγκρατείας κἀκεῖνα λέγουσι τὰ πρὸς Σαλώμην εἰρημένα, ὧν πρότερον ἐμνήσθημεν· φέρεται δέ, οἶμαι, ἐν τῷ κατ' Αἰγυπτίους εὐαγγελίῳ. φασὶ γὰρ ὅτι αὐτὸς εἶπεν ὁ σωτὴρ· ἦλθον καταλῦσαι τὰ ἔργα τῆς θηλείας, θηλείας μὲν τῆς ἐπιθυμίας, ἔργα δὲ γέννησιν καὶ φθοράν.

And those who oppose the creation of God through shameful abstinence allege those words also spoken to Salome whereof we made mention above. And they are contained, I think, in the gospel according to the Egyptians. For they say that the Saviour himself said: "I came to destroy the works of the female," the female being lust and the works birth and corruption.

ε) *Strom.*, III, 9, 66:

τί δὲ οὐχὶ καὶ τὰ ἐξῆς τῶν πρὸς Σαλώμην εἰρημένων ἐπιφέρουσιν οἱ πάντα μᾶλλον ἢ τῷ κατὰ τὴν ἀλήθειαν εὐαγγελικῷ στοιχήσαντες κανόνι; φαμένης γὰρ αὐτῆς· καλῶς οὖν ἐποίησα μὴ τεκοῦσα, ὥς οὐ δεόντως τῆς γενέσεως παραλαβανομένης, ἀμείβεται λέγων ὁ κύριος· πάσαν φάγε βοτάνην, τὴν δὲ πικρίαν ἔχουσιν μὴ φάγῃς.

And why do not they who walk any way rather than by the gospel rule of truth adduce the rest also of the words spoken to Salome? For when she said: Therefore have I done well in that I have not brought forth, as if it were not fitting to accept motherhood, the Lord replies, saying: "Eat every herb, but that which hath bitterness eat not."

δ) *Strom.*, III, 13, 92:

διὰ τοῦτό τοι ὁ Κασσιανός φησι· πυνθανομένης τῆς Σαλώμης, πότε γνωσθήσεται (ἢ γενήσεται) τὰ περὶ ὧν ἤρετο, ἔφη ὁ κύριος· ὅταν τὸ τῆς αἰσχύνης ἔνδυμα πατήσῃτε καὶ ὅταν γένῃται τὰ δύο ἓν, καὶ τὸ ἄρρεν μετὰ τῆς θηλείας, οὕτε ἄρρεν οὕτε θῆλυ.

Therefore Cassian says: When Salome inquired when those things should be concerning which she asked, the Lord said: "When ye trample on the garment of shame, and when the two shall be one, and the male with the female, neither male nor female."

9. Luke 9 : 55 f. (Textus Receptus).

καὶ εἶπεν· οὐκ οἴδατε οἶον πνεύματός ἐστε ὑμεῖς· ὁ γὰρ υἱὸς τοῦ ἀνθρώπου οὐκ ἦλθε ψυχὰς ἀνθρώπων ἀπολέσαι ἀλλὰ σῶσαι.

And he said: "Ye know not what manner of spirit ye are of. For the Son of Man came not to destroy men's lives but to save them."

10. Luke 23: 34 (Textus Receptus).

ὁ δὲ Ἰησοῦς ἔλεγε· πατέρα, ἄφες αὐτοῖς· οὐ γὰρ οἴδασιν τί ποιοῦσι.

And Jesus said: "Father forgive them, for they know not what they do."

11. 1 Cor. 11: 24 f.

τοῦτο ποιεῖτε εἰς τὴν ἐμὴν ἀνάμνησιν.

τοῦτο ποιεῖτε ὡς ἂν πίνετε εἰς τὴν ἐμὴν ἀνάμνησιν.

"This do in remembrance of me."

"This do as oft as ye drink it in remembrance of me."

The first impression gained from a critical study of the Agrapha is that but trifling intrinsic interest attaches to even the better attested group of sayings. Standing, as many of them do, torn from their context, they are often highly obscure, and except for a few that have been transmitted to us in connection with the New Testament, they add almost nothing to the gospel record. The second striking fact about them is their small number. If the Fathers, who plainly interested themselves in extra-canonical traditions, have preserved for us only these few sayings of the Lord, the reason can hardly have been other than that there were but few Agrapha to preserve. It seems as if the canonical gospels had gathered up practically all the tradition that came over into the great church from the Palestinians. The destruction of Jerusalem and the withering of Jewish Christianity cut off the Gentile church from new supplies drawn from a living tradition, and the church was thrown wholly on what the early Christians had brought it. The evangelists collected and arranged this treasure, and did their work so well that only stray bits here and there, and these of little value, were left for the gleaners. In this contrast between the richness of the gospels and the insignificance of the Agrapha and in the illustration it gives of the historical position assigned on other grounds to the gospels, not in any testimony to a supposed primitive Hebrew book, lies the chief significance of the Agrapha for the study of the New Testament.

JAMES HARDY ROPES.

HARVARD UNIVERSITY.